

# Agenda Item 6

## SHEFFIELD CONSERVATION ADVISORY GROUP

### Meeting held 22nd October, 2013

| PRESENT: | <u>Name</u>              | <u>Organisation</u>                    |
|----------|--------------------------|--|
|          | Dr. Philip Booth (Chair) | Co-opted Member                        |
|          | Mr. Tim Hale             | Sheffield Chamber of Commerce          |
|          | Prof. Clyde Binfield     | 20th Century Society                   |
|          | Mr. Patrick Burns        | Co-opted Member                        |
|          | Mr. Rod Flint            | Georgian Group                         |
|          | Mr. Howard Greaves       | Hallamshire Historic Buildings Society |
|          | Mr. Graham Hague         | Victorian Society                      |
|          | Dr. Roger Harper         | Ancient Monuments Society              |
|          | Mr. Stanley Jones        | Hunter Archaeological Society          |
|          | Dr. Jo Lintonbon         | University of Sheffield                |
|          | Mr. Bob Marshall         | Royal Town Planning Institute          |
|          | Mr. Philip Moore         | Sheffield Society of Architects        |

.....

#### 1. **DR JO LINTONBON**

The Chair reported that Dr. Jo Lintonbon, who was attending a meeting for the first time, had replaced Dr. Malcolm Tait, as the representative on the Group of the University of Sheffield.

The Group welcomed Dr. Lintonbon and placed on record its appreciation of the contribution by Dr. Malcolm Tait, to the work of the Group and extended to him its thanks and its best wishes for the future.

#### 2. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Mrs Christine Ball (Civic Trust/South Yorkshire Industrial History Society), Mr. Lee Barron (Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors, Mr. Bob Hawkins (Council for the Protection of Rural England), Mr. Andrew Shepherd (Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings) and Dr. Alan Watson (Institution of Civil Engineers).

#### 3. **MINUTES**

The minutes of the meeting held on 23rd July, 2013 were approved as a correct record and, arising therefrom, the Group (a) noted that:-

- (i) (A) the Edwardian wing of the former Jessop Hospital had been demolished and (B) no response had been given to questions regarding the re-use of the materials;
- (ii) (A) planning permission had been given for the demolition of the front of Bennet Grange, (B) the barn of Old May Farm had been converted internally to form a dwelling, (C) it was possible that the Farm was owned by the Graves Trust and (D) Mr. Greaves and Mr. Hague intended to request English Heritage to list the Farm and the nearby West

Carr Cottages;

(iii) Councillors Alan Hurst and Penny Baker had been nominated to serve as the City Council's representatives on the Group;

(iv) (A) the Chair had attended the stakeholders' meeting on 26th July last regarding the proposed Castlegate Conservation Area, (B) a working party, without representation from the Group, had been set up to consider the proposal and (C) a considerable amount of material of archaeological interest had been discovered on the site and archaeological work was continuing;

(v) (A) Amey would consider re-using in conservation areas, such as Broomhill, traditional materials retrieved from areas which were not conservation areas, such as Crookes, for the purpose of works within the Streets Ahead Project and (B) local residents could attend the scheduled public meetings regarding the Project, to request that this be done;

(vi) the Director of Regeneration and Planning would report to a future meeting on whether there had been efforts to save Cow Mouth Farm from demolition;

(vii) (A) the Director of Regeneration and Planning had expressed opposition to proposed amendments to a planning application regarding Norton Church Hall and (B) the restored grave of Francis Chantrey was located nearby;

(viii) Mr. Greaves had informed the owner of the Abbeydale Picture House that its fire curtain was possibly the only one, or one of two, of its type in the country;

(ix) the ownership of the former Firth Park Library had not changed; and

(x) the Director of Regeneration and Planning had written to Network Rail, to request that action be taken regarding the buddleia at Wicker Arches; and

(b) (i) extended its thanks to Mrs Valerie Bayliss and Mr. Greaves, for their efforts to save the Edwardian Wing, Jessop's Hospital, from demolition and (ii) expressed considerable regret that the Edwardian Wing had been demolished and that the materials had not been preserved for re-use.

(NOTE: Mr. Hale declared an interest in the above item 3(a)(ii))

#### 4. CHAIR'S REPORT

The Chair stated that:-

(a) (i) as reported in the current edition of Country Life Magazine, English Heritage was seeking volunteers to carry out surveys of the condition of heritage assets, with a view to updating its Buildings at Risk Register and (ii) the City Council, a few years previously, had employed a professional surveyor to carry out a review of the condition of heritage assets within the City;

(b) (i) the properties owned by English Heritage would be transferred to a trust, with a budget of £80m and (ii) the remainder of English Heritage would continue to give advice on matters relating to conservation areas and heritage assets;

(c) St Mark's Church, Broomhill had been included in a shortlist of 24 postwar church buildings in the Best Modern Churches competition, one of only two in Yorkshire; and

(d) Mr. David Caufield had been appointed to the post of Director of Regeneration and Planning, following the retirement of Mr. Les Sturch and Mr. Sturch's former post, of Head of Planning, had been deleted.

The Group noted the information.

#### 5. HEAD OF PLANNING'S REPORT

The Head of Planning reported that :-

(a) the Moore Street Electricity Sub-station had been listed, on Grade II;

- (b) the consultations, regarding the proposed Milton Street Conservation Area, would commence on 1st November next; and
- (c) conservation area consent had been abolished by the Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013, with the result that planning permission alone was required to demolish a building within a conservation area, thus removing the need for two applications in respect of such development. The requirements had not changed, regarding the necessary circumstances for permission to be granted.

6. **SHEFFIELD SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND DESIGN PANEL**

The Group noted that Mr. Moore had attended the meeting of the Sheffield Sustainable Development and Design Panel in September last, but the meeting scheduled for this month had been cancelled and it was possible that the meeting scheduled for 14th November would be cancelled.

The Group noted the information.

7. **HERITAGE ASSETS**

The Group considered the following applications for planning permission for development affecting Heritage Assets and made the observations stated:-

- (a) Demolition of Halls of Residence, Annexe building and Nos. 30 and 38 Taptonville Road, the erection of 94 residential units in two, three and four storey buildings and conversion of Hadow House and the Coach House to form 10 apartments, with associated car parking and landscaping on land at Crookes Road and Taptonville Road.  
**(Case Number: 13/02948/FUL)**

The Group expressed its serious disappointment at the quality of the scheme, on such a major site within a conservation area. The Group considered that the drawings did not show, how the development related to Hadow House. The Group felt that the development's relationship to the Coach House was also important. The Group considered that the approach to the detailed design was significant as the style purported to be Victorian, but it did not relate to the Victorian buildings within the area, in terms of the overall treatment and the detailing. The Group felt concern at the height of certain buildings, the future maintenance of the Arboretum and the treatment of the gateway buildings. The Group considered that all of the properties facing Taptonville Road should be built in stone and that the developer needed to have suitably qualified advice, to further the progress of the scheme.

- (b) Alterations to building including internal alterations, extension and alterations to existing external drinking area, provision of additional external drinking area and new fire exit door at the Walkabout, Carver Street **(Case Number: 13/03116/LBC)**

The Group felt that there was no objection, in principle, to the development provided that it was carried out sensitively and that the

details were to the satisfaction of the Director of Regeneration and Planning. The Group considered that the development of the open space on West Street could be feasible, perhaps with the use of umbrellas or canopies and that a treatment of the rear of the building, different from the existing decking, such as gravel or canopies could be acceptable. The Group felt that the proposed modification to allow use of the gallery as a dance floor would be inappropriate and possibly structurally unsafe. The Group recommended that internal features of the building, which was a very important building within the City Centre, be made visible again.

- (c) Use of building as a cinema and bar, at 16 George Street  
**(Case No. 13/03393/FUL and 13/03394/LBC)**

The Group welcomed the return to use of the building and had no objection in principle to the development, provided that the details were to the satisfaction of the Director of Regeneration and Planning and subject to the submission of a full schedule of repairs and servicing and to the building's advertisements being no more than as shown on the drawings.

## 8 MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS

Members of the Group reported on developments affecting Heritage Assets and Conservation Areas and the Group noted that:-

- (a) Mr. Jack Lynn, formerly a member of the City Council's Architect's Department and one of the designers of Park Hill Flats, had died recently;
- (b) the Director of Regeneration and Planning would investigate and report back on (i) the Lodge of Knowle House, East Bank Road, which was in poor condition and (ii) the possibility that plastic windows had been installed in the Bluecoat Building, Psalter Lane;
- (c) The July/August 2013 edition of Listed Heritage Magazine contained an article on the prosecution of a developer and an architect, arising from the unauthorised internal demolitions at 18 Kensington Park Gardens;
- (d) It appeared to be the case, on the advice of English Heritage, that if the facade of a building was listed, it would not be necessary to consider the rest of the building or outbuildings, when determining a planning application regarding the facade;
- (e) the Sheffield Urban Design Week 04 had run from 21st to 25th October, 2013.

(NOTE: The above minutes are subject to amendment at a future meeting)